

TORONTO TRANSIT COMMISSION REPORT NO.

MEETING DATE: July 24, 2013

SUBJECT: PROCUREMENT AUTHORIZATION
DESIGN SERVICES FOR MCNICOLL BUS GARAGE
CONTRACT G85-314

ACTION ITEM

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that the Board:

- 1) Authorize the award of Contract G85-314 Design Services for McNicoll Bus Garage to Stantec Consulting Ltd., in the upset limit amount of \$11,500,000 (inclusive of all applicable taxes) on the basis of the highest total weighted score, and an allowance amount for contract amendments of \$3,500,000 (inclusive of all applicable taxes), bringing the total authorized expenditure amount to \$15,000,000 (inclusive of all applicable taxes) for design services; and
- 2) Delegate its authority for approval of Contract Amendments in accordance with the Authorization for Expenditure and Other Commitments Policy to the Chief Executive Officer for the expenditure of the allowance.

FUNDING

Sufficient funds for this expenditure are included in the McNicoll New Bus Garage project, under the 3.9 Building and Structures Program as referenced on pages 844A – 844C of the Expansion Category of the TTC's 2013-2017 Capital Program which was approved by City Council on January 16, 2013.

BACKGROUND

There are seven bus garages throughout the city to store and maintain 1700 buses for service (service fleet). There are an additional 157 buses for major overhaul programs and warranty work. The design capacity of the seven bus garages is 1630 buses and are currently operating over capacity. This is resulting in operational inefficiencies that strain the facilities, increase costs, and may impact the quality of bus service provided, including:

- Parking buses outside, prompting additional boosting and cleaning of buses during winter months,
- Displacing body repair and vehicle painting activities in order to perform mechanical repairs in the body repair rooms and paint rooms, and

- Inefficient use of resources resulting from displacement of body repair and painting activities.

The overcapacity problem is further compounded by the introduction of articulated buses which are 6.1m longer than the conventional buses. The current bus fleet plan forecasts an increase in the service fleet to 1819 buses in 2017, 1832 buses in 2018, and peaking at 1852 buses by 2020. Therefore, to ensure proper storage and maintenance of buses, a new bus garage is required.

The scope of service for this contract includes professional design services for the preliminary and detailed design, as well as construction support of the McNicoll Bus Garage located at the intersection of Kennedy Road and McNicoll Avenue to store and maintain up to 250 buses.

DISCUSSION

A Request for Proposal (RFP) was publicly advertised on the MERX website as well as the TTC's website as of April 25, 2013. Fifty-four companies requested or downloaded copies of the proposal documents, out of which fourteen submitted a proposal by the closing date of June 6, 2013, as summarized in Appendix A.

All proposals received were reviewed for compliancy and all proposals that appeared to be compliant were rated by staff on the evaluation team. It was pre-determined that any proponent who scored a total qualitative rating of at least 70% would be considered qualified. The recommendation for award is based on the highest total weighted score which was calculated as a sum of the weighted qualitative score, and the weighted pricing score as set out in the proposal documents.

Reinders + Rieder Ltd. failed to submit Page 2 of Section 00 41 00 – Proposal Form which was a mandatory submission requirement, and after consulting with the Legal Department, it was confirmed that in accordance with the TTC's bid irregularities list, its submission is non-compliant and automatically rejected.

All compliant proposals were reviewed and rated by the evaluation team, based on the evaluation criteria listed in Appendix A.

The proposals submitted by AECOM Canada Ltd. (AECOM), Delcan-HHA Joint Venture, exp. Services Inc. in Joint Venture with Rounthwaite Dick & Hadley Architects Inc., GENIVAR Inc., Hatch Mott MacDonald Ltd., IBI Group, MMM Group Limited, Morrison Hershfield Limited, Parsons Brinckerhoff Halsall Inc. (PBH), Stantec Consulting Ltd. (Stantec), and URS Canada Inc. were considered qualified and project team members demonstrated the best relevant experience.

Following determination of the qualitative ranking, the pricing envelopes (Key Consultant Staff List) of the eleven qualified proponents were opened and evaluated and Stantec had the highest total weighted score.

The Key Consultant Staff List submitted by AECOM indicated 80 hours as its "Consultant's Standard Work Week" which appeared to be an error. After consultation with the Legal Department, it was recommended to seek clarification to determine if the 80 hours were indicative of the standard work week for each consultant or for the entire proposed team. AECOM responded that the correct number for the standard work week should be 40 hours. As a result, in accordance with the bid irregularities list, AECOM's submission contained an error and the submission is automatically rejected.

The Key Consultant Staff List submitted by PBH took an exception to the terms and conditions of the RFP by requesting foreign exchange adjustments for the proposed Project Manager. After consultation with the Legal Department, it was determined that the RFP does not include any provisions for foreign exchange adjustments, and so, by taking an exception which materially affects the intent of the RFP, the proposal submitted by PBH is non-compliant.

Upon review of the confidential pricing information, it was determined that the pricing submitted by Stantec provided the best overall value to the TTC and was considered reasonable. Stantec has previously satisfactorily performed work for the TTC.

JUSTIFICATION

A new bus garage is required in order to provide appropriate facilities for maintenance and storage of buses. The proposal submitted by Stantec Consulting Ltd. has the best overall weighted acceptable score.

June 26, 2013
50-5-169
03050-100-42

Attachments – Appendix A

APPENDIX A

PROCUREMENT AUTHORIZATION DESIGN SERVICES FOR MCNICOLL BUS GARAGE CONTRACT G85-314

LIST OF PROPONENTS (Alphabetically)

AECOM Canada Ltd.
Delcan-HHA Joint Venture
exp. Services Inc. in Joint Venture with Rounthwaite Dick & Hadley Architects Inc.
GENIVAR Inc.
Hatch Mott MacDonald Ltd.
IBI Group
jh architecture
MMM Group Limited
Morrison Hershfield Limited
Parsons Brinckerhoff Halsall Inc.
regionalArchitects and Provencher Roy + Associes Architectes
Reinders + Rieder Ltd.
Stantec Consulting Ltd.*
URS Canada Inc.

****Indicates Recommended Proponent***

EVALUATION CRITERIA

- A. Corporate Qualifications/Experience
- Background and Capabilities
 - Number of years in business
 - Depth of available resources
 - Relevant corporate experience
- B. Project Team Qualifications/Experience
- Number of years of related experience
 - Number of years of direct experience
 - Technical Qualifications
 - Description of relevant experience by project