

TORONTO TRANSIT COMMISSION REPORT NO.

MEETING DATE: March 24, 2010

SUBJECT: 29 DUFFERIN – POST-IMPLEMENTATION REVIEW OF
EXTENSION TO EXHIBITION LOOP

ACTION ITEM

RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that the Commission:

1. Approve the elimination of non-summer (September to May) service on the 29D DUFFERIN bus route between Dufferin Loop and the Princes' Gates at all times from Monday to Friday, and during the evenings on Saturdays, Sundays, and holidays, effective Tuesday, September 7, 2010; and
2. Forward this report to Deputy Mayor Pantalone, Councillors Augimeri, Moscoe, Palacio, and Perks, to Exhibition Place, Ontario Place, GO Transit, and to Metrolinx.

FUNDING

The service change described in this report will result in a reduction in net costs of \$285,000 on an annual basis.

BACKGROUND

At its meeting on February 17, 2010, in considering the report 29 DUFFERIN – POST-IMPLEMENTATION REVIEW OF EXTENSION TO EXHIBITION LOOP, the Commission approved recommendation #2 of that report, which was to “approve a routing change to the 29D DUFFERIN bus route in Exhibition Place, as described in this report, effective May 9, 2010.” This routing change will modify the existing trial routing of the service through Exhibition Place, in order to attract more customers to the bus service.

Recommendation #1 in that report, to “approve the elimination of non-summer service on the 29D DUFFERIN bus route between Dufferin Loop and the Princes' Gates at all times from Monday to Friday, and during the evenings on Saturdays, Sundays, and holidays, effective Tuesday, September 7, 2010” was deferred by the Commission to its meeting on March 24, 2010.

This report is the post-implementation review on the trial extension to Exhibition Place, and includes, unchanged, the recommendation that was deferred from the meeting on February 17, 2010.

DISCUSSION

Route changes

Prior to 2007, most service on the 29 DUFFERIN bus route terminated at the south end of the route at Dufferin Gates Loop at Exhibition Place. From mid-May to mid-August each year, service is extended into Exhibition Place to serve the higher seasonal ridership to Exhibition Place and Ontario Place. This 29B DUFFERIN (Wilson Station-Exhibition and Ontario Place) seasonal service is a regular part of the TTC network (see map attached).

At its meeting on September 20, 2006, the Commission directed staff to implement a new year-round trial extension of the 29 DUFFERIN route that would connect directly with the streetcar service at Exhibition Loop, and would more closely serve the new soccer stadium at Exhibition Place. Operation of this new trial 29D DUFFERIN (Wilson Station-Exhibition (Princes' Gates)) service commenced on May 13, 2007.

Post-Implementation Reviews

The TTC uses a formal process for planning and evaluating service changes based on a set of Commission-approved service standards. Every new service that the TTC introduces is initially operated on a trial basis. After a minimum six-month trial period, when ridership on the service has approached a mature state, passenger counts are taken, the performance of the route is reviewed, and a recommendation is made regarding its future. All service changes are reviewed to ensure that the original objective of better service for customers has been met. New routes and extensions, which have been introduced at an additional cost, undergo a ridership and financial review to check that the service has met established standards of acceptable ridership, and financial performance. The overall review also considers comments that have been received from customers and the community, and the experience that has been gained in operating the service.

A service change, which has met its performance objectives, is recommended to be made a regular part of the TTC system. If a service change has been unsuccessful in some way, then a recommendation is made to either make further changes for another trial period, or to remove the service. The compulsory post-implementation review of every trial service change ensures that the success or failure of every service change is assessed consistently and fairly, and that there is full accountability to the Commission on matters which affect the service that is provided to customers.

Most service changes implemented through this process have been successful. Of the 87 trial service changes made and evaluated since 1998, 64 of the changes attracted sufficient ridership that they meet the TTC's financial performance targets, and are now a regular part of the TTC system.

29 DUFFERIN bus route – Extension to Exhibition Loop

The year-round trial extension to Exhibition Loop began in May 2007. Buses on the trial 29D DUFFERIN (Wilson Station-Exhibition/Princes' Gates) service operate along the north side of Exhibition Place, serving Exhibition Loop, and terminating near the Princes' Gates (see map attached). Buses on this service operate via Saskatchewan Road, Manitoba Drive, and Canada Drive, in both directions. In addition to the Exhibition streetcar loop, buses also serve the Exhibition GO Station and other venues along the north side of Exhibition Place. The service operates at all times, except during major events at Exhibition Place, such as the Canadian National Exhibition, when the grounds are closed to buses and other vehicles.

It was projected that, on typical non-event days, approximately 300 customer-trips per day would be made on the new routing. However, because Exhibition Place was already well serviced by frequent transit service, it was also projected that very few of these customers would be new to the TTC but, rather, simply diverted from other existing services. On the day of the most recent non-summer passenger counts, approximately 230 customer-trips were made on the extended routing on a weekday, approximately 950 customer-trips were made on Saturday, and approximately 640 customer-trips were made on Sunday. These customers have a shorter walk to the different venues and employment locations within Exhibition Place.

The change increased operating costs because one bus was added to operate the longer route. A ridership and financial performance analysis was conducted, and is summarised in Table 1 below.

Table 1: Financial performance of the trial extension during non-summer months

29D DUFFERIN – In Exhibition Place Ridership and Financial Performance Existing Routing				
	Total customer-trips made each day on the new service	New customers attracted to the TTC	Financial Performance (new customers/net \$ operating cost)	Does service meet minimum financial performance of 0.23?
Monday to Friday peak periods	120	less than 10	0.02	Fails
Monday to Friday mid-day	55	less than 10	0.01	Fails
Monday to Friday early evening	20	less than 10	0.02	Fails
Monday to Friday late evening	30	less than 10	0.03	Fails
Saturday daytime	720	70	0.13	Fails
Saturday early evening	130	15	0.10	Fails
Saturday late evening	100	20	0.15	Fails
Sunday daytime	560	40	0.10	Fails
Sunday early evening	70	less than 10	0.06	Fails
Sunday late evening	10	less than 10	0.01	Fails

Counts of passengers on the trial non-summer service show that at all periods of operation, the number of new customer-trips made on the new service is significantly less than the ridership required to meet acceptable financial standards. The financial performance of the new service ranges between 0.01 and 0.15 new customers per net direct dollar of operating cost. In all cases, this is below the minimum standard of 0.23.

There is no opportunity to reduce the operating costs of the new service. One bus was added to operate the service, and so less service cannot be operated without reducing service for customers on the main part of the route.

Revised Routing

Exhibition Place staff suggested that the routing be changed to operate via a large on-street loop on Manitoba Drive, Canada Drive, and Princes' Boulevard, and this suggestion has been evaluated by TTC staff. This routing change would continue to serve Exhibition Loop, while bringing service closer to attractions farther south in Exhibition Place, including the Direct Energy Centre, the Allstream Centre, and Ontario Place. With this change, buses would continue to operate eastbound on Manitoba Drive and south on Canada Drive, and would then continue west on Princes' Boulevard, north and west on Nunavut Road, west and north on Nova Scotia Avenue, and west on Manitoba Drive.

The routing change would improve service for customers travelling to or from destinations south of the streetcar loop, as they would have a shorter walk to or from the nearest bus stop. The change would make service worse for customers travelling westbound from the streetcar route, as they would have a slightly longer travel time, as they would have to travel the longer distance around the on-street loop.

An assessment of the change in weighted customer travel time shows that the benefits of a shorter walk for new customers attracted to the service will be greater than the inconvenience of a longer travel time for existing customers. Overall, the change would make service better for customers.

The proposed route would operate with the same cost as the current service and there would be no change to the scheduled intervals between buses or the scheduled trip times.

It is projected that, outside of the summer, 30 customer-trips would be made on the new routing each day from Monday to Friday, 10 of which would be new to the TTC; approximately 200 customer-trips would be made on the new routing on Saturdays, 60 of which would be new to the TTC; and approximately 140 customer-trips would be made on the new routing on Sundays, 40 of which would be new to the TTC. Table 2, below, presents the ridership and financial analysis of the proposed revised routing via Princes' Boulevard.

Table 2: Financial performance of the proposed routing during non-summer months

29D DUFFERIN – In Exhibition Place Ridership and Financial Performance Proposed New Routing via Princes’ Boulevard				
	Total customer-trips made each day on the new service	New customers attracted to the TTC	Financial Performance (new customers/net \$ operating cost)	Does service meet minimum financial performance of 0.23?
Monday to Friday peak periods	135	15	0.04	Fails
Monday to Friday mid-day	60	less than 10	0.02	Fails
Monday to Friday early evening	25	less than 10	0.02	Fails
Monday to Friday late evening	35	less than 10	0.03	Fails
Saturday daytime	870	115	0.25	Passes
Saturday early evening	160	20	0.18	Fails
Saturday late evening	120	25	0.22	Fails
Sunday daytime	680	80	0.23	Passes
Sunday early evening	85	10	0.09	Fails
Sunday late evening	10	less than 10	0.01	Fails

The projected ridership resulting from the rerouting via Princes’ Boulevard shows that sufficient additional customers are projected to be attracted during the daytime on Saturdays and Sundays to meet the minimum financial standard. As a result, staff recommended and the Commission approved at its meeting on February 17, 2010 that non-summer service, via the new routing, be operated during the daytime on Saturdays, Sundays, and holidays for a continued trial period.

Even with the additional ridership attracted by the route change via Princes’ Boulevard, the non-summer service at all times from Monday to Friday and in the evenings on Saturdays and Sundays does not meet the minimum financial standard. There is no prospect of reducing costs or improving the financial performance of the service. It is therefore recommended that all Monday to Friday service, and evening service on Saturdays, Sundays, and holidays, on the 29 DUFFERIN route between Dufferin Loop and the Princes’ Gates be eliminated, effective Tuesday, September 7, 2010.

During the summer months the service will continue to operate at all times of the week on the revised 29D DUFFERIN (Wilson Station-Exhibition (Princes’ Gates)) routing for a further trial period. This service will operate until the start of the CNE in mid-August. Ridership counts will be conducted during this period, and a post-implementation review of the summer service will be presented to the Commission after the summer trial period is complete. The reduced weekend non-summer service will start in September 2010 and ridership counts will be conducted, and a post-implementation review of the weekend non-summer service will be presented to the Commission in 2011.

There will be no change to the 29B DUFFERIN (Wilson Station-Exhibition and Ontario Place) summer service, which will continue to operate from mid-May until mid-August.

JUSTIFICATION

The post-implementation review of service changes is an important part of the TTC's service standards. New services that meet the minimum financial standard will be confirmed as a regular part of the TTC system, and those which do not meet the standard will be adjusted or eliminated. The extension of the 29 DUFFERIN bus between Dufferin Loop and the Princes' Gates during the non-summer months does not meet the minimum financial standard from Monday to Friday or during the evenings on Saturdays and Sundays, and so is recommended for removal. Service on this route extension during the daytime on Saturdays, Sundays, and holidays during the non-summer months will continue, on a revised routing, for a further trial period as approved by the Commission at its meeting on February 17, 2010.

March 1, 2010

11-31-57

Attachments: Map: Year-Round Extension of 29 DUFFERIN Bus into Exhibition Place
(showing revised routing on Princes' Boulevard)



Year-Round Extension of 29 Dufferin Bus into Exhibition Place

